Community Discernment and Planning Feedback Summary for the Lincoln Square Grouping

Submitted to the

Renew My Church Standards and Recommendations Commission

October 12, 2019

Dear Commission Members,

We are pleased to share with you this Feedback Summary for our Lincoln Square Grouping and look forward to discussing it with you on October 21, 2019.

OVERALL FEEDBACK SUMMARY

The Lincoln Square Grouping Feedback and Discernment Team (GFDT) recognizes the realities of the Renew My Church (RMC) process and embraces the opportunity to make disciples, build community and inspire witness in a revitalized structure.

The GFDT feels strongly that the Lincoln Square corridor, with a growing and diverse population including multiple ethnicities and many young families, must provide enough opportunities for our community to participate in the Eucharist by maintaining at least three worship sites.

U.S. Census data shows Lincoln Square as one of the few Chicago neighborhoods reporting population growth. From 2012 to 2017, the neighborhood reported a population gain of about 7 percent, approximately 42,000 people total. Additional data shows approximately 44 percent of Lincoln Square's families have children under the age of 18. The GFDT strongly believes three schools must remain in Lincoln Square to meet the Catholic, faith-based education needs for generations to come.

Within this document, the Lincoln Square GFDT provides responses and rationale to the scenarios provided by the Archdiocese of Chicago. An alternative parish scenario also is provided.

First and foremost, we express our deep sadness at the prospect of losing Transfiguration of Our Lord Parish; however, the existing parishes of St. Hilary, St. Matthias and Queen of Angels embrace the gift of welcoming new disciples.

On the parish side, the configurations seen as best meeting the aspirations of Renew My Church are Scenarios 1 and 2 where the Transfiguration community unites with either Queen of Angels or St. Hilary. Depending on the scenario, St. Matthias would either unite with St. Hilary or Queen of Angels and would remain open as a worship site.

The alternative Scenario 6 also receives support. In this scenario Queen of Angels, St. Matthias, and St. Hilary retain their current parish status and Transfiguration unites with St. Matthias.

Receiving far less support are Scenarios 3, 4 and 5. Scenario 4 entails three parishes combining into one with closures of both Transfiguration and St. Matthias. Scenarios 3 and 5 close Transfiguration. Among the concerns are: taking away community access to the Eucharist by closing two churches; inadequate priest-to-parishioner support if only one priest is available per parish; staff reduction and imbalanced workload; and logistic challenges of combining financials, campus oversight and ministries.

The GFDT supports all three schools remaining open, and all three having a liturgical worship site anchored to each school. There were two school scenarios presented and of the two, School Scenario 1 is strongly preferred.

The GFDT believes School Scenario 2 is not viable and would result in large-scale attrition as many families would leave if there were a dual upper-, lower-grade campus structure in place. Distance, the prospect of splitting younger and older children/siblings, and the logistics of combining the St. Matthias International Baccalaureate (IB) program with the non-IB St. Hilary are among the concerns with this scenario. We understand there are additional discussions underway to see if one of the schools might become a non-parish Archdiocesan school. Concerns with this approach are discussed in the "Other Considerations" section.

<u>Additional Feedback and Implementation Concerns for Consideration</u>

Theme One: Transfiguration Parish's Future

Transfiguration parish strongly desires to remain united in its entirety with its "receiving parish" under all the scenarios. Contrary to language in the initial scenario document, they do not want to split up the Filipino and Spanish-speaking communities between different parishes.

During the weekend of October 5 and 6 Transfiguration parish polled its members to see which of the potential receiving parishes they would feel more comfortable joining. 529 people of the 836 in attendance responded, and 71% expressed a desire to join St. Hilary parish (Scenario 2 in the feedback document).

Theme Two: Creativity in Ministry

Given the likelihood that there will only be one Spanish-speaking pastor in the Grouping, a ministry plan for the area should be developed that includes the skills of parish staff and laity to meet the ministry needs of the Spanish-speaking and Filipino communities. Additionally, there may be

other opportunities for different parishes to share their unique ministries to make Catholic life in the Lincoln Square neighborhood more vibrant as well as to reduce the duplication of work.

Theme Three: The Future of St. Matthias School

St. Matthias is by any measure a very successful Catholic school. The first all-grade International Baccalaureate (IB) Catholic school in the diocese, it enjoys a wonderful reputation and an enrollment consistently well above the minimum benchmarks.

As parishes in Lincoln Square are re-configured, it is the strong desire of St. Matthias School to remain a "parish school" with a direct connection to the local faith community and the pastoral and financial support such a connection entails for at least three years. If two schools with different frameworks for teaching (IB vs non-IB) cannot be governed under one parish, then the school needs to engage in conversation with the Office of Catholic Schools and the Archdiocese to determine how to best address the pastoral and sacramental needs of students and families. If St. Matthias merges with another parish whereby two schools exist under one parish, both schools would need clarity about how relationships will be formed between the parish and the schools as well as the schools to each other.

Theme Four: Preserving St. Matthias as a Worship Site

Closing St. Matthias Church as a worship site at this point is not seen as consistent with Renew My Church principles. That would cut in half the number of worship sites in an area that is growing and attracting new families. The GFDT feels it will take time to adjust to the new configuration and requests it be allowed five years to live in the new parish and school configurations before any additional church closures are contemplated.

Theme Five: Priest/Pastor Continuity during Transitions

In those instances where a parish is closing and the people from that parish, their ministries, and celebrations would be transitioning to another parish, it would be helpful to have the current priest/pastor be part of the transition process. Given the priest/pastor's familiarity with the people and ministries, he could help establish new norms for their religious celebrations and how to combine with the new parish and thereby limit attrition. This period could be a transition of 3 to 6 months depending on the parish and the compatibilities between the two parishes.

Theme Six: School Scenario 1 Evaluation Period

The three schools in the school scenario 1 may not meet all the school criteria and benchmarks set by the archdiocese (i.e., minimum enrollment, balanced budget, etc.). The Grouping would like to suggest that each school have an evaluation period and be re-assessed at a minimum of three years before any decisions on next steps would be made. This would give each school an opportunity to develop and implement new marketing tools/strategies and outreach to adjacent communities without a Catholic school to enhance enrollment.

Theme Seven: Staff Care during Transitions and Future Staff Considerations

The staff who work at the four parishes of Lincoln Square already work their normal schedules and then some to provide adequate support to the pastor and people. As parishes in the Grouping are re-configured, we understand there may be staff reductions and consolidations. At the same time, we hope the new parish structures will allow for proper lay staffing, especially if the scenario that is chosen creates a community of over 2,000. And in the cases where there are reductions, we would ask that current staff be treated fairly and be given priority for newly created positions in all Grouping parishes.

Theme Eight: Taking the Pastors' Full Workload into Consideration when Making Pastor and Associate Assignments

The pastors in Lincoln Square have many responsibilities outside their parishes. For example, the current Lincoln Square pastors split "on-call" coverage at local hospitals, each taking a 13-week coverage period during the year. We urge that duties like these be factored into decision-making by the Archdiocese on placing pastors and associates in the re-configured Grouping.

Conclusion

After many prayerful meetings we submit our feedback to you of various scenarios and conclude with the suggestion that parish scenarios 1 and 2 and school scenario 1 are the most appropriate to fulfill Christ's mission in our neighborhood and the Archdiocese. These scenarios would meet the aspirations of Renew My Church and position our parishes and schools for growth.

Thank you for your prayerful reflection and consideration of our feedback.

Submitted respectfully with the endorsement of the pastors, principals, and parish delegates,

<u>Queen of Angels</u>	<u>St. Hilary</u>	<u>St. Matthias</u>	<u>Transfiguration of Our Lord</u>
Msgr. Jim Kaczorowski	Fr. Aloysius Funtila	Fr. Larry McNally	Fr. Fernando Zuleta
Julia Kelly	Fr. Tom Libera	Karyn McGovern	Ivonne Alzate-Barrios
Rachel Hohner	Kathleen Donovan	Mark Meier	Jordi Garcia
Christina Tomaso	Marianita Calsita	Katie Carden	Salvacion Martinez
Loretta Namovic	Brigit Isaacson	Terry Adkins	Elizabeth Niederpruem
Guillermo Tenorio	David Kalensky	Sara Goddard	Luke Niederpruem
Martha Lacunza	Elizabeth Cadiz	Bill Horan	

Parish Scenario 1:

Parish 1: St. Hilary and St. Matthias unite as one parish. Both churches remain open; the sustainability of operating both churches would be continuously reviewed by parish leadership; the archdiocese would formally re-evaluate in no more than 5 years.

Parish 2: Queen of Angels and Transfiguration unite as one parish at Queen of Angels Church. Transfiguration Church would close.

RENEW MY CHURCH ASPIRATION	How well does this scenario challenge the grouping to move beyond maintaining current structures to invest a higher percentage of time and resources in ministry? How will this scenario support vitality and stability for the long-term (10+ years), considering demographic and parishioner trends?	This scenario was seen as meeting the aspirations of Renew My Church and was viewed favorably. It invests in time and ministry with a focus on long-term sustainability by reestablishing four parishes into two via three active worship sites. This opportunity challenged the Lincoln Square GFDT to balance the spiritual goals of Renew My Church and our faith community with structural and economic realities. This two-parish structure, coupled with School Scenario 1, provides renewed opportunity to make disciples, build community and inspire witness by avoiding geographic deserts, allowing for growth in Catholic education, streamlining financial and facility operations, and uniting vibrant ministerial resources. The scenario reduces the number of pastors needed from four to two, maintains a manageable travel range for priests, parishioners and students, and provides acceptable pastor-to-parishioner ratios. The scenario maintains a strong Spanish-language presence without requiring the addition of Spanish Masses.
MEETS LOCAL MISSION NEEDS	How well does this scenario address particular local needs? Respects particular local vitality and culture Prevents geographical Catholic deserts Accounts for demographic trends such as shifts in population	Lincoln Square has established itself as a vibrant, diverse, family-friendly neighborhood. Demographics and population data suggest young adults, especially those with young children, will continue to make Lincoln Square home. At the same time, our neighborhood is proudly rooted in Chicago tradition. Many multi-generation families worship at their local church and invest in Catholic education, whether at one of our three schools or through our strong Religious Education programs. Scenario 1 showcases three sites for worship, mapping well along Lincoln Avenue from north to south. It blends three active and faith-filled cultures.

PARISH STRUCTURAL **PRINCIPLES**

How well does this scenario fit with the Foundational Principles for Structural Viability?

- Minimum of 800 parishioners attending Mass for a full-time resident pastor, based on the number of pastors in the future
- Operating revenue: \$750,000+ for basic staffing
- Can afford facility repairs and maintenance

Scenario 1 has components that fit the Foundational Principles for Structural Viability, and some that present concerns.

Presuming no attrition, the two parishes exceed benchmarks in both October count (with growth potential) and operating revenue.

- St. Hilary/St. Matthias 1,318 parishioners; ~1.2MM Operating Revenue; (~1.31MM) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) (~106k)
- Queen of Angels/Transfiguration 1,786 parishioners; ~993k Operating Revenue; (~889k) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) ~104k

Assuming 30% attrition will only impact Transfiguration community merging with Queen of Angels:

- 30% attrition: 1,556 parishioners; ~907k Operating Revenue; (~889k) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) ~18k
 - Assuming no reduction in operating expenses for Queen of Angels
 - Operating risk will occur if attrition falls below is 85%: ~750k operating revenue

Scenario 1 brings together the established Spanish speaking communities of Queen of Angels and Transfiguration and has the potential to grow the Filipino presence at Queen of Angels. It also gives an established home to Transfiguration's vibrant and engaged youth group, many of whom are in the Spanish-language community. Additionally, the Spanish-language needs that are met by Queens lay staff can continue to serve the Spanish-language needs of the Transfiguration community.

Sts. Hilary and Matthias parish would not require the addition of a Spanish Mass or a Spanish-speaking priest in the grouping, which is important because of the lack of Spanish-speaking priests. Additional lay staff who speak Spanish will not be required.

This scenario presumes one pastor at each of the two parishes, which would be a reduction from the current structure from four to two. This directly addresses concerns related to the priest shortage. However, there are concerns among the GFDT that one pastor/priest at Queen of Angels would not be adequate to serve 1,800 parishioners and 400 school students/families, plus additional

		community responsibilities. The GFDT feels this parishioner base in two worship sites requires an associate pastor or additional priest.
		Scenario 1 would reduce some operating expenses by uniting staff, phasing out existing fixed expenses at Transfiguration, sharing ministerial programming and controlling building needs to ensure fiscal solvency. Based on available data, it is presumed there would be very few additional fixed expenses. Concerns with this scenario relate directly to bottom-line operating expenses
		and income and the ability to maintain the number of structures at Sts. Hilary and Matthias parish. The combined parish would need to evaluate the needs for all the buildings and the expense to operate those buildings over time.
		Church facility expenses: St. Hilary/St. Matthias – (~1.64MM) – convent part of school expense Queen of Angels/Transfiguration – (~783k) - includes gym/multipurpose building
		Additional scenario concerns relate to maintaining all the structures at two worship sites with high deferred maintenance costs, plus the ability for one pastor to minister to a large congregation that potentially includes two PK-8 schools, potentially leading to a second round of consolidation in a short period of time.
		The GFDT believes an appropriately sized lay staff would be required to provide adequate pastoral and ministerial support to the parish and its parishioners.
	Will this scenario be manageable for pastors, clergy,	From a geography standpoint, Scenario 1 is manageable. However, there are concerns related to building administration and sacramental coverage.
MANAGEABILITY	 and parish staff? Geography: potential travel across sites Administration: Number of buildings Pastoral care: Sacramental coverage 	Sts. Hilary and Matthias are 1.4 miles away from one another and are easily reachable for parishioners who walk/take public transportation. Parking is available at all sites. At the same time, it could be challenging for one pastor/priest to be able to say Mass at each location on a given Sunday. Liturgy schedules at Sts. Hilary and Matthias would need to be evaluated and adjusted to accommodate priest availability and mass coverage. In addition, there are concerns about proper coverage of other services such as funerals, and coordination of weekday Masses and school Masses at the two schools.

		Concerns about building maintenance also were considered by the team. Sts. Hilary and Matthias each have a number of structures, and each have a school. Managing, maintaining and properly planning for the known and unknown structural/interior needs of the buildings would need to be evaluated. An evaluation of the overall need and use of building structures would determine if all buildings/structures are needed for the ongoing vitality of the parish.
		More information provided under the School Scenario section; however, Parish Scenario 1 aligns well with either school scenario. Anchor church buildings aligned to each of the three schools remain open and active for worship, thus ensuring students can continue to participate in Masses and sacraments at their "school" church.
SCHOOL VITALITY & SUSTAINABILITY	How does this scenario support school vitality and sustainability? (i.e., potential to reach minimum of 240 students in PK-8 based on local area demographics and parish student population)	As the scenario currently stands, there is concern this could present challenges to the pastor and key lay staff in development/fundraising endeavors for the schools, and adequate distribution of church-to-school financial support. It would be less of a concern if St. Matthias became an independent, Archdiocesan school. Parish Scenario 1 meets the goals of avoiding geographic deserts.

Parish Scenario 2:

Parish 1: St. Hilary and Transfiguration unite as one parish at St. Hilary Church. Transfiguration Church would close.

Parish 2: St. Matthias and Queen of Angels Parishes unite as one parish. Both churches remain open; the sustainability of operating both churches would be continuously reviewed by parish leadership with a formal re-evaluation with the archdiocese in no more than 5 years.

RENEW MY CHURCH ASPIRATION	How well does this scenario challenge the grouping to move beyond maintaining current structures to invest a higher percentage of time and resources in ministry? How will this scenario support vitality and stability for the long-term (10+ years), considering demographic and parishioner trends?	Similar to Scenario 1, Scenario 2 addressed the challenges presented to team and was seen by most of the GFDT as meeting Renew My Church's aspirations. Scenario 2 also looked at the long-term sustainability of the grouping structure by re-establishing four parishes into two via three active worship sites. This opportunity challenged the Lincoln Square GFDT to balance the spiritual goals of Renew My Church and our faith community with structural and economic realities. This two-parish structure (coupled with School Scenario 1) provides renewed opportunity to make disciples, build community and inspire witness by avoiding geographic deserts, allowing for growth in Catholic education, streamlining financial and facility operations, and uniting vibrant ministerial resources. Scenario 2 reduces the number of pastors needed from four to two. The GFDT believes Scenario 2 provides a favorable travel range for priests, parishioners and students; it also has a favorable pastor-to-parishioner ratio.
MEETS LOCAL MISSION NEEDS	 How well does this scenario address particular local needs? Respects particular local vitality and culture Prevents geographical Catholic deserts Accounts for demographic trends such as shifts in population 	 There are many geographic and cultural advantages to this scenario. Queen of Angels and St. Matthias are geographically close, only .7 miles apart, and share similarities in population/culture. Transfiguration and St. Hilary are geographically close, 1.2 miles apart, and share similarities in population/culture. Liturgical sites for all three schools would be available. Sacramental preparation would be easier. Easily reachable for parishioners who walk/take public transportation. Parking is readily available at all sites. There are no more than two parishes merging into one.

		 Brings together two Filipino communities with the Transfiguration community uniting with the St. Hilary community. Scenario 2 showcases three sites for worship, mapping well along Lincoln Avenue from north to south, thus avoiding geographic deserts, providing growth opportunities and answering the call to make disciples and build communities.
PARISH STRUCTURAL PRINCIPLES	How well does this scenario fit with the Foundational Principles for Structural Viability? • Minimum of 800 parishioners attending Mass for a full-time resident pastor, based on the number of pastors in the future • Operating revenue: \$750,000+ for basic staffing • Can afford facility repairs and maintenance	Scenario 2 has components that fit the Foundational Principles for Structural Viability, and some that present concerns. Presuming no attrition, the two parishes would exceed benchmarks in both October count (with room for growth) and operating revenue. • St. Hilary/Transfiguration – 1,655 parishioners; ~973 Operating Revenue; (~664k) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) ~309k • Queen of Angels/St. Matthias – 1,449 parishioners; ~1.22MM Operating Revenue; (~1.53MM) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) (~310k) Assuming 30% attrition impacts Transfiguration community merger with St. Hilary: • 30% attrition: 1,425 parishioners; ~887k Operating Revenue; (~664k) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) ~223k • Assuming no reduction in operating expenses for St. Hilary • Attrition levels would need to exceed 78% to incur operating revenue risk This scenario presumes one pastor at each of the two parishes, which would be a reduction from the current structure from four to two. This directly addresses concerns related to the priest shortage. However, there are concerns with ensuring adequate priest support and lay employees to carry out the mission of the combined parishioner base between St. Matthias and Queen of Angels. It also would require a Spanish-speaking priest at both parishes. The scenario would reduce operating expenses via the closing of one parish and the union of two others into one; there should be few additional fixed expenses.

the parishioners are Spanish speaking and attend the long-established weekly Spanish Mass at Queen of Angels. Will this scenario be manageable for pastors, clergy, and parish staff? Geography: potential travel across sites Trom a geography standpoint, Scenario 2 is very manageable. There are concerns related to building administration and operation/administrative coverage.			Additional concerns surrounding building structure and maintenance also emerged and if the resulting financial realities would adequately cover facility needs. The buildings and structures would need to be evaluated for usability to determine if all buildings and structures are needed to operate the combined parishes. From a facility expense perspective St. Hilary/Transfiguration – (~640k) – convent part of school expense Queen of Angels/St. Matthias – (~1.78MM) – includes gym/multipurpose building for Queen of Angels; convent part of school expense for St Matthias. Additional Scenario 2 concerns relate to maintaining St. Matthias as a worship site with high deferred maintenance costs among its buildings, plus the feasibility of one pastor having the bandwidth to minister to a large parishioner base at two sites. The GFDT feels this parishioner base in two worship sites requires an associate pastor or additional priest. Depending on school scenario decisions, another concern is that Scenario 2 could leave one pastor at St. Matthias/Queen of Angels potentially overseeing two large PK-8 th schools (total of 700+ students.) There is significant concern that this would present challenges to the pastor and key lay staff in development/fundraising endeavors for the schools and adequate distribution of church-to-school financial and overhead support. This scenario presumes additional Spanish-speaking staff would be needed at the St. Hilary site to address the administrative needs of the former Transfiguration community. An alternative consideration was discussed where only one Spanish ministry would exist in the grouping at one worship site, namely St. Hilary. However, this would require all Spanish-speaking parishioners to move to the site with the Spanish liturgies and ministries. This would meet with strong resistance from Queen of Angels since 24 percent of
MANAGEABILITY Will this scenario be manageable for pastors, clergy, and parish staff? concerns related to building administration and operation/administrative			would meet with strong resistance from Queen of Angels since 24 percent of the parishioners are Spanish speaking and attend the long-established weekly Spanish Mass at Queen of Angels.
	MANAGEABILITY	and parish staff?	concerns related to building administration and operation/administrative

	 Administration: Number of buildings Pastoral care: Sacramental coverage 	St. Hilary and Transfiguration are 1.4 miles away from one another and St. Hilary has very large parking facility. St. Hilary would need to assess the mass schedule to offer a Spanish Mass from 1/month to at least 1/week to better serve the Transfiguration community. A Tagalog Mass could be added to the mass schedule at St. Hilary. St. Matthias and Queen of Angels are .7 miles away and very manageable to travel between for a pastor/priest and parishioners. The combined St. Matthias and Queen of Angels parish would need to be adequately staffed with priests and lay employees. Concerns about building maintenance should be taken into account. There could be difficulty in managing, maintaining and properly planning for the known and unknown structural/interior needs of the buildings. Each building would need to be assessed as to use/purpose, required maintenance, and develop a maintenance plan in order to be fiscally responsible for planned maintenance. Unplanned maintenance may occur. Scenario 2 would result in two separate parishes offering Spanish-language ministry at a time when the number of Spanish-speaking priests is limited. The team discussed the potential of utilizing deacons for support with Spanish liturgies. There is the potential to harmonize the mass schedules between the parishes in the grouping to accommodate 2 Spanish masses at 2 different churches with 1 Spanish-speaking priest.
SCHOOL VITALITY & SUSTAINABILITY	How does this scenario support school vitality and sustainability? (i.e., potential to reach minimum of 240 students in PK-8 based on local area demographics and parish student population)	More thorough information is provided under the School Scenario section; however, Parish Scenario 2 aligns well with either of the school scenarios. Church buildings aligned to each of the three schools remain open and active for worship, thus ensuring students can continue to participate in Masses and sacraments at their "school" church. A key concern that emerged (also covered above in "Parish Structural Principles") is that Scenario 2 could leave one pastor at St. Matthias/Queen of Angels overseeing two large PK-8 th schools (total of 700+ students) if both schools remain in their current structure. As the scenario currently stands, there is concern this could present challenges to the pastor and key lay staff in development/fundraising endeavors for the

schools, and adequate distribution of church-to-school financial support. It would be less of a concern if St. Matthias became an independent, Archdiocesan school.
Parish Scenario 2 meets the goals of avoiding geographic deserts.

Parish Scenario 3:

Parish 1: St. Hilary, St. Matthias, and Transfiguration unite as one parish. Transfiguration Church would close. St. Hilary and St. Matthias churches remain open; the sustainability of operating both churches would be continuously reviewed by parish leadership with a formal re-evaluation with the archdiocese in no more than 5 years.

Parish 2: Queen of Angels Parish remains in its current structure.

		The GFDT feels Scenario 3 could be an option; however, there are concerns around the complexities of uniting three parishes into one.
RENEW MY CHURCH ASPIRATION	How well does this scenario challenge the grouping to move beyond maintaining current structures to invest a higher percentage of time and resources in ministry?	Scenario 3 provides for vitality and stability in the growing Lincoln Square neighborhood, while keeping all three schools open and anchored to a parish or active worship site.
	How will this scenario support vitality and stability for the long-term (10+ years), considering demographic and parishioner trends?	Concerns about building maintenance should be considered. There could be difficulty in managing, maintaining and properly planning for the known and unknown structural/interior needs of the buildings.
		The combined parish would need to be adequately staffed with priests and lay employees.
		Like Scenario 2, there are geographic and cultural advantages to this scenario.
MEETS LOCAL MISSION NEEDS	How well does this scenario address particular local needs? • Respects particular local vitality and culture • Prevents geographical Catholic deserts • Accounts for demographic trends such as shifts in population	 Transfiguration, St. Hilary and St. Matthias are geographically close. Liturgical sites for all three schools would be available. Sacramental preparation for school and religious ed. would be easier. Easily reachable for parishioners who walk/take public transportation. Parking is readily available at all sites. Scenario 3 showcases three sites for worship, mapping well along Lincoln Avenue from north to south, thus avoiding geographic deserts, providing
		growth opportunities and answering the call to make disciples and build communities.
PARISH STRUCTURAL PRINCIPLES	How well does this scenario fit with the Foundational Principles for Structural Viability?	Scenario 3 takes a different approach to the Foundational Principles for Structural Viability than the other scenarios. There are advantages; however, the GFDT is concerned that there would be challenges in maintaining the large

- Minimum of 800 parishioners attending Mass for a full-time resident pastor, based on the number of pastors in the future
- Operating revenue: \$750,000+ for basic staffing
- Can afford facility repairs and maintenance

campuses of Sts. Hilary and Matthias given historic and projected financial performance.

In a best-case scenario with no attrition:

- St. Hilary/St. Matthias/Transfiguration 2,085 parishioners; ~1.49MM
 Operating Revenue; (~1.31MM) Operating Expenses; net
 surplus(deficit) ~182k
- Queen of Angels 1,019 parishioners; ~705k Operating Revenue;
 (~889k) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) (~183k)
- A reallocation of parish fundraising revenue from the school would put the church revenue above the 750k benchmark without compromising school surplus

Assuming 30% attrition impacts Transfiguration community merger with St. Hilary and St. Matthias:

- 30% attrition: 1,855 parishioners; ~1.4MM Operating Revenue; (~1.11M)
 Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) ~292k
 - Assuming reduction in operating expenses of 15% for St. Hilary and St. Matthias
 - No parishioner or operating revenue risk if the Transfiguration community do not attend St. Hilary or St. Matthias

This scenario presumes one pastor at each of the two parishes, which would be a reduction from the current structure from four to two. This directly addresses concerns related to the priest shortage.

However, there are serious concerns that one pastor and staff would be able to support a very large parishioner base of 2,085, adding to that two schools also in need of oversight. The GFDT feels this parishioner base in two worship sites requires an associate pastor or additional priest.

Mass schedules would need to be evaluated and possibly modified to include Spanish and Tagalog masses as well as priest availability between the two worship sites. Bilingual or Spanish-speaking lay staff will also be necessary in the newly combined parish to meet the needs of the former Transfiguration community.

		The scenario would reduce operating expenses via the closing of one parish and the union of two others into one; there should be few additional fixed expenses. However, as stated above, an associate pastor/priest and adequate staff would be required to successfully minister to 2,085 parishioners. From a facility expense perspective St. Hilary/St. Matthias/Transfiguration – (~1.64MM) – convent part of school expense Queen of Angels – (~783k) - includes gym/multipurpose building Concerns surrounding building structure and maintenance are balanced by an increase in operating income which, if properly managed and planned, could help address capital needs. Each building/structure would need to be evaluated for use/purpose and maintenance requirements. A detailed plan would need to be implemented which included maintenance and resources needed to provide maintenance at both sites.
MANAGEABILITY	Will this scenario be manageable for pastors, clergy, and parish staff? • Geography: potential travel across sites • Administration: Number of buildings • Pastoral care: Sacramental coverage	From a geography standpoint, Scenario 3 is manageable. There are concerns related to building administration and sacramental coverage. Sts. Hilary and Matthias are 1.4 miles away from one another. It would be challenging for one pastor/priest to be able to celebrate Mass at each location on a given Sunday. Mass schedule changes would be needed. In addition, there are concerns about proper coverage of other services such as funerals and coordination of weekday Masses and school Masses at the two schools. Each building would need to be assessed as to use/purpose, required maintenance, and develop a maintenance plan in order to be fiscally responsible for planned maintenance. Unplanned maintenance may occur.
SCHOOL VITALITY & SUSTAINABILITY	How does this scenario support school vitality and sustainability? (i.e., potential to reach minimum of 240 students in PK-8 based on local area demographics and parish student population)	More information is provided under the School Scenario section; however, Parish Scenario 3 aligns well with either school scenario. Anchor church buildings aligned to each of the three schools remain open and active for worship, ensuring students can continue to participate in Masses and sacraments at their "school" church. Parish Scenario 3 meets the goals of avoiding geographic deserts.

Parish Scenario 4:

Parish 1: St. Hilary, St. Matthias, and Transfiguration unite as one parish. St. Hilary remains open as the parish church. Both St. Matthias Church and Transfiguration Church would close.

Parish 2: Queen of Angels Parish remains in its current structure.

		-
RENEW MY CHURCH ASPIRATION	How well does this scenario challenge the grouping to move beyond maintaining current structures to invest a higher percentage of time and resources in ministry? How will this scenario support vitality and stability for the long-term (10+ years), considering demographic and parishioner trends?	The GFDT feels this scenario does not meet the mission Imperatives of RMC of making disciples, building communities or inspiring witness because it closes two full parishes and leaves St. Matthias school without a worship-site anchor. The community may not react well to closing two of the four church worship sites, and it would potentially disperse the Lincoln Square Catholic community rather than unite it. It also has added complexities of combining three parishes into one parish (Parish 1). The combined parish would need to be adequately staffed with priests and lay employees. The team does not feel Scenario 4 would support vitality and stability for the long term, considering the population trends and growth potential in Lincoln Square.
MEETS LOCAL MISSION NEEDS	How well does this scenario address particular local needs? Respects particular local vitality and culture Prevents geographical Catholic deserts Accounts for demographic trends such as shifts in population	Overall, the team does not believe Scenario 4 would support local needs in that it would provide fewer opportunities for residents of Lincoln Square to invest in their spiritual life. While it would cover the area geographically by placing two parishes at each end of the geographical grouping, it leaves a void for the students at St. Matthias school who would have less access to weekly Mass and sacramental development. The team believes Scenario 4 does not consider the potential for population growth of Lincoln Square and the demographic spread, which includes a large number of young adults and young families. There are geographic and cultural advantages to this scenario. Transfiguration, St. Hilary and St. Matthias are geographically close. They are easily reachable for parishioners who walk/take public transportation. Parking is readily available at all sites.

		 Geographical disadvantages to this scenario: There would not be a liturgical site for the St. Matthias school There would need to be a creative solution to minister to the Spanish-speaking communities across two parishes
PARISH STRUCTURAL PRINCIPLES	How well does this scenario fit with the Foundational Principles for Structural Viability? • Minimum of 800 parishioners attending Mass for a full-time resident pastor, based on the number of pastors in the future • Operating revenue: \$750,000+ for basic staffing • Can afford facility repairs and maintenance	Scenario 4 meets the Foundational Principles for Structural Viability, but not without sacrificing spiritual vitality in Lincoln Square. In addition to spiritual vitality, St. Matthias recently underwent extensive church renovations which is another reason closing the church building is too aggressive at this point. Presuming no attrition, the two parishes would exceed benchmarks in both October count and operating revenue. In a best-case scenario with no attrition: • St. Hilary/St. Matthias/Transfiguration – 2,085 parishioners; ~1.49MM Operating Revenue; (~664k) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) ~825k • Queen of Angels – 1,019 parishioners; ~705k Operating Revenue; (~889k) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) (~183k) • A reallocation of parish fundraising revenue from the school would put the church revenue above the 750k benchmark without compromising school surplus Assuming 30% attrition impacts both Transfiguration and St. Matthias community merger with St. Hilary: • 30% attrition: 1,589 parishioners; ~1.2MM Operating Revenue; (~664k) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) ~534k • Assuming no reduction in operating expenses for St. Hilary • There is no parishioner risk if the Transfiguration and St. Matthias community does not attend St. Hilary • Operating risk will occur if attrition falls below 76%: ~750k operating revenue From a facility expense perspective • St. Hilary/St. Matthias/Transfiguration – (~640k) – convent part of school expense • Queen of Angels – (~783k) – includes gym/multipurpose building

		Scenario 4 would have lower operating costs than Scenario 2, and if property at St. Matthias were sold, it could be applied to existing debt and provide substantial capital for the new parish. Scenario 4 presumes one pastor at each of the two parishes, which would be a reduction from the current structure from four to two. This directly addresses concerns related to the priest shortage. However, there are concerns with ensuring adequate priest support and lay employees to carry out the mission of the combined parishioner base at Parish 1. And, as in Scenario 2, it would require a Spanish-speaking priest and Spanish-speaking lay staff at both parishes.
MANAGEABILITY	Will this scenario be manageable for pastors, clergy, and parish staff? Geography: potential travel across sites Administration: Number of buildings Pastoral care: Sacramental coverage	From a geography standpoint, Scenario 4 is manageable. However, there are concerns related to spiritual vitality and sacramental coverage. Sts. Hilary and Matthias are 1.4 miles away from one another. St. Hilary and Transfiguration are also 1.4 miles away from each other. Transfiguration and St. Matthias are .8 miles from each other. Their parishioner bases geographically overlap. However, for the population that currently walk or take public transportation to St. Matthias and Transfiguration, the new location at St. Hilary could be beyond their reasonable distance for travel. Additionally, while this does reduce the number of buildings and therefore operating costs for Parish 1, our team believes that closing the church structure of St. Matthias is too aggressive and parishioners in the community would not react well to the closure. Therefore, it is not conducive to growing our community of disciples. Mass schedule changes would be needed. In addition, there are concerns about proper coverage of other services such as funerals, and coordination of weekday Masses. There is also concern for the lack of a liturgical worship site for the St. Matthias school. Scenario 4 would need a creative solution to serve our Spanish-speaking community across two parishes as it would result in two separate parishes offering Spanish language ministry at a time when the number of Spanish-speaking priests is limited. The team discussed the potential of utilizing deacons for support with Spanish liturgies.

SCHOOL VITALITY
&
SUSTAINABILITY

How does this scenario support school vitality and sustainability? (i.e., potential to reach minimum of 240 students in PK-8 based on local area demographics and parish student population)

This scenario would align with School Scenario 1; however, it would leave St. Matthias school with a spiritual and sacramental void by not having a worship location on site. St. Matthias would have to be creative with their current space for scheduling school liturgies.

Parish Scenario 5:

Parish 1: St. Hilary Parish remains in its current parish structure.

Parish 2: St. Matthias, Queen of Angels, and Transfiguration unite as one parish. Transfiguration Church closes. Both St. Matthias and Queen of Angels Churches remain open; the sustainability of operating both churches would be continuously reviewed by parish leadership with a formal re-evaluation with the archdiocese in no more than 5 years.

RENEW MY CHURCH ASPIRATION	How well does this scenario challenge the grouping to move beyond maintaining current structures to invest a higher percentage of time and resources in ministry? How will this scenario support vitality and stability for the long-term (10+ years), considering demographic and parishioner trends?	This scenario did not receive strong support from the GFDT. There are concerns around the complexities of uniting three parishes into one. This scenario presents a pastoral challenge of combining three parishes into one. Parish 1 would just be meeting the benchmarks set forth for the operating revenue and parishioner count, while still needing maintenance repairs on their church and school, which is not ideal for growth and making new disciples. Parish 1 would also need to grow their school student count to reach the minimum enrollment number of 240, without gaining new parishioners to draw students from.
MEETS LOCAL MISSION NEEDS	How well does this scenario address particular local needs? • Respects particular local vitality and culture • Prevents geographical Catholic deserts • Accounts for demographic trends such as shifts in population	Transfiguration, St. Matthias, and Queen of Angels have geographical overlap of where parishioners are traveling from. They are all close to public transportation for CTA/walking parishioners. It does not seem to create a geographical desert. For pastoral manageability, St. Matthias and Queen of Angels are only .7 miles from each other, so the two campuses would be relatively close making it simpler to manage. This scenario brings together the two largest Spanish speaking populations which are currently at Transfiguration and Queen of Angels. However, the two largest Filipino communities are at St. Hilary and Transfiguration, and this scenario does not bring those two communities together.
PARISH STRUCTURAL PRINCIPLES	How well does this scenario fit with the Foundational Principles for Structural Viability?	This scenario barely meets the Foundational Principles for Parish 1. According to the most up-to-date information, both Parish 1 and Parish 2 would meet the Operating Revenue and the Parishioner Count. However, Parish 1 would just barely be making the benchmark numbers, while still needing maintenance

	 Minimum of 800 parishioners attending Mass for a full-time resident pastor, based on the number of pastors in the future Operating revenue: \$750,000+ for basic staffing Can afford facility repairs and maintenance 	repairs on the church and school. Parish 1 would also need to grow student enrollment to reach the minimum number of 240 and wouldn't be gaining new parishioners to draw new students from. In a best-case scenario with no attrition: St. Hilary – 888 parishioners; ~685k Operating Revenue; (~664k) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) ~22k Queen of Angels/Transfiguration/St. Matthias – 2,216 parishioners; ~1.51MM Operating Revenue; (~1.53MM) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) (~23k) Assuming 30% attrition only impacts Transfiguration community merger with Queen of Angels and St. Matthias: 30% attrition: 1,986 parishioners; ~1.42MM Operating Revenue; (~1.3MM) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) ~120k Assuming reduction in operating expenses of 15% for Queen of Angels and St. Matthias No parishioner or operating revenue risk if the Transfiguration community do not attend Queen of Angels. From a facility expense perspective St. Hilary – (~640k) – convent part of school expenses Queen of Angels/ St. Matthias/Transfiguration – (~1.78MM) – not including convent at St. Matthias
MANAGEABILITY	Will this scenario be manageable for pastors, clergy, and parish staff? • Geography: potential travel across sites • Administration: Number of buildings • Pastoral care: Sacramental coverage	This scenario seems geographically manageable for pastors, clergy, and parish staff. St. Hilary remaining in its current form is a simple option for Parish 1. For Parish 2, the two campuses are only .7 miles apart from each other, which seems reasonable to manage travel across sites. With the combination of buildings from Queen of Angels and St. Matthias, further consideration should be taken as to which buildings on each campus are necessary for the most efficient management of buildings. Each building would need to be assessed as to use/purpose, required maintenance, and develop a maintenance plan in order to be fiscally responsible for planned maintenance. Unplanned maintenance may occur.

		However, it may be more pastorally challenging to bring three parishes together into one (as opposed to two in other scenarios). In Parish 2, there would be over 2,000 parishioners which would need a larger staff to support the parish.
SCHOOL VITALITY & SUSTAINABILITY	How does this scenario support school vitality and sustainability? (i.e., potential to reach minimum of 240 students in PK-8 based on local area demographics and parish student population)	This scenario would align with School Scenario 1, where all schools remain in their current programs, with St. Matthias becoming an independently governed school. St. Hilary's current enrollment would be beneath the minimum of 240 students, and it would not be adding new parishioners to their parish for new potential students.

Alternative Parish Scenario 6:

- Parish 1: St. Matthias and Transfiguration unite as one parish at St. Matthias. Transfiguration Church would close.
- Parish 2: Queen of Angels remains in its current parish structure.
- Parish 3: St. Hilary remains in its current parish structure.

	<u>, </u>	
RENEW MY CHURCH ASPIRATION	How well does this scenario challenge the grouping to move beyond maintaining current structures to invest a higher percentage of time and resources in ministry? How will this scenario support vitality and stability for the long-term (10+ years), considering demographic and parishioner trends?	The GFDT feels scenario 6 could be an option; however, there are concerns around the complexities of having three parishes. This scenario may not meet all the RMC aspirations. It aligns with School Scenario 1, removing the complexities on pastoral staff of managing multiple campuses, limits the community fallout due to an aggressive merger, and provides a better distribution of revenues across all parishes. This scenario reduces the number of required pastors from four to three. Challenges include addressing the needs of the Transfiguration community and resolving how to grow operating revenue and enrollment at St. Hilary parish and school. This scenario leaves some concerned that if St. Matthias parish doesn't turn itself around, the parish will revisit the Renew My Church process in 5 years.
MEETS LOCAL MISSION NEEDS	How well does this scenario address particular local needs? • Respects particular local vitality and culture • Prevents geographical Catholic deserts • Accounts for demographic trends such as shifts in population	Bringing together the parishes of Transfiguration and St. Matthias meets the local needs of the community in many ways. • Uniting shared ministries creates a larger community for people to grow in. • A larger and better resourced parish in the center of the Grouping could allow for expanding ministries and evangelization in the middle of the Lincoln Square community • The Transfiguration community would have a parish school within a half mile of their original church.
PARISH STRUCTURAL PRINCIPLES	How well does this scenario fit with the Foundational Principles for Structural Viability?	Currently, Queen of Angels church meets the October counts but has an operating deficit. However, a reallocation of parish fundraising revenue from the school would put the church revenue above the 750k benchmark without compromising school surplus.

	 Minimum of 800 parishioners attending Mass for a full-time resident pastor, based on the number of pastors in the future Operating revenue: \$750,000+ for basic staffing Can afford facility repairs and maintenance 	 1,019 parishioners; ~705K Operating Revenue; (~888k) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) (~183k) The operating revenue at St. Hilary's would be below 750k. However, operating revenue exceeds operating expenses by ~21k, so this is not viewed as a negative:
	can anoru raciity repairs and maintenance	 888 parishioners; ~685k Operating Revenue; (~664k) Operative Expenses; net surplus(deficit) ~21k
		A Transfiguration/St. Matthias union would net the following results: • 1,197 parishioners; ~804k Operating Revenue; (~644k) Operating Expenses (which is assumed to only be coming from St. Matthias); net surplus(deficit) ~160k
		Assuming 30% attrition will only impact merger with Transfiguration: • 30% - 967 parishioners, ~717k Operating Revenue; (~644k) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) ~73k
		 Parishioner risk will occur in the event of 52% attrition: (798 parishioners) Operating risk will occur in the event of 56% attrition: ~643k Operating Revenue; (~644k) Operating Expenses; net surplus(deficit) (~800)
		This scenario offers a better distribution of revenue for all three parishes.
		 Church facility expenses across the grouping team are more evenly distributed: Queen of Angels – (~783k) – includes gym/multipurpose building St. Matthias/Transfiguration – (~1MM) – convent part of school expenses St. Hilary – (~640K) – convent part of school expenses
		This scenario could allow for the payment of much of the outstanding debt at Transfiguration and St. Matthias through the sale of buildings at the Transfiguration site. Any surplus funds could help cover necessary repairs.
MANAGEABILITY	Will this scenario be manageable for pastors, clergy, and parish staff? Geography: potential travel across sites Administration: Number of buildings	This scenario is the most manageable for pastors, clergy and parish staff: • Geographically, the Transfiguration and St. Matthias communities are a half mile from each other

	Pastoral care: Sacramental coverage	 The remaining three parishes will be one-church parishes which are easier for pastors to manage pastorally and financially. Currently, St. Matthias does not offer a Tagalog or Spanish mass. It does not address the challenge of having Spanish language ministry needs in two parishes. Concerns over why the parish/school merger failed in 2002 and the need for a more organized, transparent, and welcoming union would occur.
SCHOOL VITALITY & SUSTAINABILITY	How does this scenario support school vitality and sustainability? (i.e., potential to reach minimum of 240 students in PK-8 based on local area demographics and parish student population)	This scenario best aligns with School scenario 1. Provides the Transfiguration community a parish school within walking distance from Transfiguration church Eliminates the challenges of a school operating as a non-parish Archdiocesan school. Current figures (not include new students from Transfiguration) Queen of Angels – 401 enrolled; ~3.39MM Operating Revenue; (~3.24MM) Operating Expense; netting a surplus(deficit) per student ~\$380 St. Matthias – 299 enrolled; 2.11MM Operating Revenue; (~2.12MM) Operating Expense; netting a surplus(deficit) per student (~\$35) St. Hilary – 178 enrolled; 1.24MM Operating Revenue; (~1.26MM) Operating Expense; netting a surplus(deficit) per student (~\$94) In this scenario, St. Hilary does not meet the enrollment benchmark. However, there is opportunity for growth north of St. Hilary. This scenario provides a better distribution of church facility expenses across the grouping: Queen of Angels – (~618k) - expense of gym/multipurpose room part of Church expenses St. Matthias/Transfiguration – (~350k) – includes convent space being used for school St. Hilary – (~402k) – includes convent space being used for school

School Scenario 1: Schools remain in their current programs		
SCHOOL VITALITY & SUSTAINABILITY	How does this scenario support school vitality and sustainability? (i.e., potential to reach minimum of 240 students in PK-8 based on local area demographics and parish student population)	 This scenario was seen by the GFDT as being best able to support the Grouping's three schools as the parishes are re-configured. It allows three academically strong Catholic schools to serve parents who can select the school closest to them or the school with an educational approach they find appealing. It allows all 3 schools to continue in their current academic curriculum. It avoids creating a Catholic school desert in the Grouping. Parents would not have to deal with the challenge of having children at more than one campus. St. Hilary School's enrollment is below the 240-student benchmark. The school is financially sustainability St. Hilary will implement a three-year marketing plan to increase enrollment with a focus on the immediate community and a targeted larger focus on the desert areas of Skokie and Lincolnwood. St. Matthias School has some capacity constraints that may limit its ability to grow beyond one class in each grade. In the scenario where St. Matthias Church closes, provision would need to be made for the weekly Mass to be held on site or transportation would need to be arranged to another church.
Financial Information		School Scenario 1: In a best-case scenario with no attrition: • Queen of Angels – 401 enrolled; ~3.39MM Operating Revenue; (~3.24MM) Operating Expense; netting a surplus(deficit) per student ~\$380 • St. Matthias – 299 enrolled; 2.11MM Operating Revenue; (~2.12MM) Operating Expense; netting a surplus(deficit) per student (~\$40) • St. Hilary – 178 enrolled; 1.24MM Operating Revenue; (~1.26MM) Operating Expense; netting a surplus(deficit) per student (~\$90) This scenario provides a better distribution of church facility expenses across the grouping:

	 Queen of Angels – (~783k) – expense of gym/multipurpose room part
	of Church expenses
	 St. Matthias/Transfiguration – (~350k) – includes convent space being
	used for school
	 St. Hilary – (~402k) – includes convent space being used for school

•	as Schools unite as one school program and operate lo continues in its current program.	wer grades at one campus and upper grades at the other campus.
SCHOOL VITALITY & SUSTAINABILITY	How does this scenario support school vitality and sustainability? (i.e., potential to reach minimum of 240 students in PK-8 based on local area demographics and parish student population)	This scenario was seen by the GFDT as having far more disadvantages than advantages. Although it would keep all three school campuses open and avoid having a Catholic school desert in the Grouping. • The combined two campus school could utilize the extra capacity at St. Hilary, allowing St. Hilary school to meet the RMC sustainability benchmark and remain open. • St. Hilary and St. Matthias have different teaching philosophies. If the 2 schools were to merge, there are 2 options: 1. St. Hilary would need to become an IB school or 2. St. Matthias would need to drop the IB program. Either way, a sizeable number of families may choose not to attend the combined school undermining the goal of boosting enrollment. • In parish scenarios where St. Matthias and St. Hilary are not combined it is not clear what new parish would "own" and support the two-campus school. • There are additional costs related to being an IB school (annual license fees and teacher training/con-ed). • The schools would no longer be "walkable" for many local families and parents with multiple children would need to coordinate drop off and pick up at two sites. The St. Hilary site is more distant from the rail transit options that St. Matthias families use. • The schools may have to explore busing options to accommodate families with different campus drop-offs. This would be an added expense that would need to be absorbed and may create budget issues. • In the scenario where St. Matthias Church closes, provision would need to be made for the weekly Mass to be held on site or transportation would need to be arranged to another Church. • Controversy over the school merger could undermine the "fresh start" needed in the newly reconfigured parishes.
Financial Information		School Scenario 2: With no attrition: • Queen of Angels – 401 enrolled; ~3.39MM Operating Revenue; (~3.24MM) Operating Expense; netting a surplus(deficit) per student ~\$380

	 St. Hilary/St Matthias – 477 enrolled; 3.35MM Operating Revenue; (~3.37MM) Operating Expense; netting a surplus(deficit) per student (~\$60)
	Assuming attrition only impacts St. Hilary and St. Matthias: 10% attrition: 429 enrolled at a surplus(deficit) per student (~\$450) 20% attrition: 358 enrolled at a surplus(deficit) per student (~\$940) 30% attrition: 239 enrolled at a surplus(deficit) per student (~\$1600) Surplus(deficit) per student don't include facility expenses
	 From a facility expense perspective Queen of Angels – (~618k) – expense of gym/multipurpose room part of Church expenses St. Hilary/St Matthias – (~752k) – includes convent space being used for both schools